

## 評価対象論文リスト(要因:身体活動、アウトカム:フレイル)

評価判定日:2023/9/29

### ①既存の系統的レビュー・メタ解析・統合解析

1	Navarrete-Villanueva D, Gómez-Cabello A, Marín-Puyalto J, Moreno LA, Vicente-Rodríguez G, Casajús JA. Frailty and physical fitness in elderly people: a systematic review and meta-analysis. <i>Sports Med.</i> 2021;51(1):143-160. doi:10.1007/s40279-020-01361-1
2	Lopez P, Izquierdo M, Radaelli R, et al. Effectiveness of multimodal training on functional capacity in frail older people: a meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. <i>Journal of Aging and Physical Activity.</i> 2018;26(3):407-418. doi:10.1123/japa.2017-0188
3	Liao CD, Chen HC, Huang SW, Liou TH. The role of muscle mass gain following protein supplementation plus exercise therapy in older adults with sarcopenia and frailty risks: a systematic review and meta-regression analysis of randomized trials. <i>Nutrients.</i> 2019;11(8):1713. doi:10.3390/nu11081713
4	Giné-Garriga M, Roqué-Fíguls M, Coll-Planas L, Sitjà-Rabert M, Salvà A. Physical exercise interventions for improving performance-based measures of physical function in community-dwelling, frail older adults: a systematic review and meta-analysis. <i>Archives of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation.</i> 2014;95(4):753-769.e3. doi:10.1016/j.apmr.2013.11.007
5	Daryanti Saragih I, Yang Y, Saragih IS, Batubara SO, Lin C. Effects of resistance bands exercise for frail older adults: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised controlled studies. <i>Journal of Clinical Nursing.</i> 2022;31(1-2):43-61. doi:10.1111/jocn.15950
6	Frost R, Belk C, Jovicic A, et al. Health promotion interventions for community-dwelling older people with mild or pre-frailty: a systematic review and meta-analysis. <i>BMC Geriatr.</i> 2017;17(1):157. doi:10.1186/s12877-017-0547-8
7	Chou CH, Hwang CL, Wu YT. Effect of exercise on physical function, daily living activities, and quality of life in the frail older adults: a meta-analysis. <i>Archives of Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation.</i> 2012;93(2):237-244. doi:10.1016/j.apmr.2011.08.042
8	Han CY, Miller M, Yaxley A, Baldwin C, Woodman R, Sharma Y. Effectiveness of combined exercise and nutrition interventions in prefrail or frail older hospitalised patients: a systematic review and meta-analysis. <i>BMJ Open.</i> 2020;10(12):e040146. doi:10.1136/bmjopen-2020-040146
9	Zhang Y, Zhang Y, Du S, Wang Q, Xia H, Sun R. Exercise interventions for improving physical function, daily living activities and quality of life in community-dwelling frail older adults: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. <i>Geriatric Nursing.</i> 2020;41(3):261-273. doi:10.1016/j.gerinurse.2019.10.006
10	Rossi PG, Carnavale BF, Farche ACS, Ansai JH, De Andrade LP, Takahashi ACDM. Effects of physical exercise on the cognition of older adults with frailty syndrome: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized trials. <i>Archives of Gerontology and Geriatrics.</i> 2021;93:104322. doi:10.1016/j.archger.2020.104322
11	Campbell E, Petermann-Rocha F, Welsh P, et al. The effect of exercise on quality of life and activities of daily life in frail older adults: A systematic review of randomised control trials. <i>Experimental Gerontology.</i> 2021;147:111287. doi:10.1016/j.exger.2021.111287

12	Kojima G. Frailty as a predictor of nursing home placement among community-dwelling older adults: a systematic review and meta-analysis. <i>Journal of Geriatric Physical Therapy</i> . 2018;41(1):42-48. doi:10.1519/JPT.000000000000097
13	Liao CD, Lee PH, Hsiao DJ, et al. Effects of protein supplementation combined with exercise intervention on frailty indices, body composition, and physical function in frail older adults. <i>Nutrients</i> . 2018;10(12):1916. doi:10.3390/nu10121916
14	The FICSIT Group, Schechtman KB, Ory MG. The effects of exercise on the quality of life of frail older adults: A preplanned meta-analysis of the FICSIT trials. <i>ann behav med</i> . 2001;23(3):186-197. doi:10.1207/S15324796ABM2303_6
15	Oliveira JS, Pinheiro MB, Fairhall N, et al. Evidence on physical activity and the prevention of frailty and sarcopenia among older people: a systematic review to inform the world health organization physical activity guidelines. <i>Journal of Physical Activity and Health</i> . 2020;17(12):1247-1258. doi:10.1123/jpah.2020-0323
16	Macdonald SHF, Travers J, Shé EN, et al. Primary care interventions to address physical frailty among community-dwelling adults aged 60 years or older: A meta-analysis. <i>Vina J, ed. PLoS ONE</i> . 2020;15(2):e0228821. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0228821
17	Kidd T, Mold F, Jones C, et al. What are the most effective interventions to improve physical performance in pre-frail and frail adults? A systematic review of randomised control trials. <i>BMC Geriatr</i> . 2019;19(1):184. doi:10.1186/s12877-019-1196-x
18	Cadore EL, Rodríguez-Mañas L, Sinclair A, Izquierdo M. Effects of different exercise interventions on risk of falls, gait ability, and balance in physically frail older adults: a systematic review. <i>Rejuvenation Research</i> . 2013;16(2):105-114. doi:10.1089/rej.2012.1397
19	De Labra C, Guimaraes-Pinheiro C, Maseda A, Lorenzo T, Millán-Calenti JC. Effects of physical exercise interventions in frail older adults: a systematic review of randomized controlled trials. <i>BMC Geriatr</i> . 2015;15(1):154. doi:10.1186/s12877-015-0155-4
20	Lopez P, Pinto RS, Radaelli R, et al. Benefits of resistance training in physically frail elderly: a systematic review. <i>Aging Clin Exp Res</i> . 2018;30(8):889-899. doi:10.1007/s40520-017-0863-z
21	Dedeyne L, Deschodt M, Verschueren S, Tournoy J, Gielen E. Effects of multi-domain interventions in (pre)frail elderly on frailty, functional, and cognitive status: a systematic review. <i>Clin Interv Aging</i> . 2017;12:873-896. Published 2017 May 24. doi:10.2147/CIA.S130794
22	Apóstolo J, Cooke R, Bobrowicz-Campos E, et al. Effectiveness of interventions to prevent pre-frailty and frailty progression in older adults: a systematic review. <i>JBISIRIR-2017-003382</i> . 2018;16(1):140-232. doi:10.11124/JBISIRIR-2017-003382
23	Jadczak AD, Makwana N, Luscombe-Marsh N, Visvanathan R, Schultz TJ. Effectiveness of exercise interventions on physical function in community-dwelling frail older people: an umbrella review of systematic reviews. <i>JBISIRIR-2017-003551</i> . 2018;16(3):752-775. doi:10.11124/JBISIRIR-2017-003551
24	Talar K, Hernández-Belmonte A, Vetrovsky T, Steffl M, Kałamačka E, Courel-Ibáñez J. Benefits of resistance training in early and late stages of frailty and sarcopenia: a systematic review and meta-analysis of randomized controlled studies. <i>JCM</i> . 2021;10(8):1630. doi:10.3390/jcm10081630

25	Silva RB, Aldoradin-Cabeza H, Eslick GD, Phu S, Duque G. The Effect of Physical Exercise on Frail Older Persons: A Systematic Review. <i>J Frailty Aging</i> . 2017;6(2):91-96. doi:10.14283/jfa.2017.7
26	Zheng L, Li G, Wang X, et al. Effect of exergames on physical outcomes in frail elderly: a systematic review. <i>Aging Clin Exp Res</i> . 2020;32(11):2187-2200. doi:10.1007/s40520-019-01344-x
27	Travers J, Romero-Ortuno R, Bailey J, Cooney MT. Delaying and reversing frailty: a systematic review of primary care interventions. <i>Br J Gen Pract</i> . 2019;69(678):e61-e69. doi:10.3399/bjgp18X700241
28	van Rijckevorsel-Scheele J, Willems RCWJ, Roelofs PDDM, Koppelaar E, Gobbens RJJ, Goumans MJB. Effects of health care interventions on quality of life among frail elderly: a systematized review. <i>Clin Interv Aging</i> . 2019;14:643-658. Published 2019 Apr 4. doi:10.2147/CIA.S190425
29	Chin A Paw MJM, Van Uffelen JGZ, Riphagen I, Van Mechelen W. The functional effects of physical exercise training in frail older people: a systematic review. <i>Sports Medicine</i> . 2008;38(9):781-793. doi:10.2165/00007256-200838090-00006
30	Anthony K, Robinson K, Logan P, Gordon AL, Harwood RH, Masud T. Chair-based exercises for frail older people: a systematic review. <i>BioMed Research International</i> . 2013;2013:1-9. doi:10.1155/2013/309506
31	Jakicic JM, Kraus WE, Powell KE, et al. Association between bout duration of physical activity and health: systematic review. <i>Medicine &amp; Science in Sports &amp; Exercise</i> . 2019;51(6):1213-1219. doi:10.1249/MSS.0000000000001933
32	Daniels R, Van Rossum E, De Witte L, Kempen GI, Van Den Heuvel W. Interventions to prevent disability in frail community-dwelling elderly: a systematic review. <i>BMC Health Serv Res</i> . 2008;8(1):278. doi:10.1186/1472-6963-8-278
33	Clegg AP, Barber SE, Young JB, Forster A, Iliffe SJ. Do home-based exercise interventions improve outcomes for frail older people? Findings from a systematic review. <i>Rev Clin Gerontol</i> . 2012;22(1):68-78. doi:10.1017/S0959259811000165
34	Mañas A, Del Pozo-Cruz B, García-García FJ, Guadalupe-Grau A, Ara I. Role of objectively measured sedentary behaviour in physical performance, frailty and mortality among older adults: A short systematic review. <i>European Journal of Sport Science</i> . 2017;17(7):940-953. doi:10.1080/17461391.2017.1327983
35	Theou O, Stathokostas L, Roland KP, et al. The effectiveness of exercise interventions for the management of frailty: a systematic review. <i>Journal of Aging Research</i> . 2011;2011:1-19. doi:10.4061/2011/569194
36	Chen YC, Lin K chung, Chen CJ, Wang CH. Effects of leisure-time physical activity interventions on frailty-related characteristics of frail older adults in long-term care: a systematic review. <i>Contemporary Nurse</i> . 2020;56(1):34-48. doi:10.1080/10376178.2020.1737555
37	Kehler DS, Hay JL, Stammers AN, et al. A systematic review of the association between sedentary behaviors with frailty. <i>Experimental Gerontology</i> . 2018;114:1-12. doi:10.1016/j.exger.2018.10.010
38	Tolley APL, Ramsey KA, Rojer AGM, Reijniense EM, Maier AB. Objectively measured physical activity is associated with frailty in community-dwelling older adults: A systematic review. <i>Journal of Clinical Epidemiology</i> . 2021;137:218-230. doi:10.1016/j.jclinepi.2021.04.009
39	Negm AM, Kennedy CC, Thabane L, et al. Management of frailty: a systematic review and network meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials. <i>Journal of the American Medical Directors Association</i> . 2019;20(10):1190-1198. doi:10.1016/j.jamda.2019.08.009
40	Lafortune L, Martin S, Kelly S, et al. Behavioural risk factors in mid-life associated with successful ageing, disability, dementia and frailty in later life: a rapid systematic review. Wang Y, ed. <i>PLoS ONE</i> . 2016;11(2):e0144405. doi:10.1371/journal.pone.0144405

41	O'Caoimh R, Galluzzo L, Rodríguez-Laso A, et al. Transitions and trajectories in frailty states over time: a systematic review of the European Joint Action ADVANTAGE. <i>Ann Ist Super Sanita</i> . 2018;54(3):246-252. doi:10.4415/ANN 18 03 12
----	---

## ②日本人の個別研究

42	吉澤裕世, 田中友規, 高橋競, 藤崎万裕, 飯島勝矢. 地域在住高齢者における身体・文化・地域活動の重複実施とフレイルとの関係. <i>June 2019</i> . doi:10.11236/jph.66.6_306
43	上村一貴, 山田実, 岡本啓. フレイル予防に向けたアクティブ・ラーニング型健康教育介入の効果. 2018. doi:10.15063/rigaku.11411
44	松本浩実, 大坂裕, 井上和興, 朴大昊, 萩野浩. 地域高齢者におけるフレイルの進行度と運動および運動自己効力感の関連性について. 2019. doi:10.15063/rigaku.11657

## ③有力な研究

45	Fiatarone MA, O'Neill EF, Ryan ND, et al. Exercise training and nutritional supplementation for physical frailty in very elderly people. <i>N Engl J Med</i> . 1994;330(25):1769-1775. doi:10.1056/NEJM199406233302501
----	--

■メタ解析、系統的レビュー

Reference			Include study						Design	Category	Relative risk (95% CI or p)	Comments
Author	Title	Year	Ref No.	First author	Year	Study period	Study location	Event (*Definition)				
Daryanti Saragih I, Yang YP, Saragih IS, Batubara SO, Lin CJ	Effects of resistance bands exercise for frail older adults: A systematic review and meta-analysis of randomised controlled studies	2021		Seino et al	2017	12 week	Japan	frailty phenotype score	RCT	exercise group: Seino et al.,  overall (6 studies)	SMD = -0.49 (-0.94, -0.03)  SDM = -0.13 (-0.30, 0.04)	frailty phenotype score
Liao CD, Lee PH, Hsiao DJ, Huang SW, Tsauo JY, Chen HC, Liou TH	Effects of Protein Supplementation Combined with Exercise Intervention on Frailty Indices, Body Composition, and Physical Function in Frail Older Adults	2018	54	Kim	2015	12 weeks	Japan	frailty score	RCT	control( 0 = frailty, 1 = no frailty)  exercise group	1.00 (Reference)  OR = 3.64, 95%CI = 1.12–11.85	all female, Physical comprehensive training 30 minutes of strengthening exercises, 20 minutes of balance and gait training, followed by a five minute cool-down  運動によりフレイルスコア改善
Tolley APL, Ramsey KA, Rojer AGM, Reijnierse EM, Maier AB.	Objectively measured physical activity is associated with frailty in community-dwelling older adults: A systematic review	2021	50	Chen	2020					LPA (light physical activity)  MVPA (moderate-to-vigorous physical activity)  Steps	Higher frailty  Lower frailty  Lower frailty	

			SB (sedentary behaviour)	Lower fraility
			SBB (sedentary behaviour bouts)	Lower fraility
44	Nagai	2018	LPA (light physical activity)	Lower fraility
			MVPA (moderate-to-vigorous physical activity)	Lower fraility
			SB (sedentary behaviour)	Higher fraility
49	Yuki	2019	LPA (light physical activity)	Lower fraility
			MVPA (moderate-to-vigorous physical activity)	Lower fraility
			Steps	Lower fraility

---